

APPENDIX D – TOPICS DISCUSSION

Documentation of requested information and note taking solicited through public comment.

SUGGESTED ITEMS TO STIMULATE DISCUSSION IN VARIOUS SERVICE AREAS OR MEETING TOPICS

The following outline is to serve as a template for the Blue Ribbon Commission to review topics and guide future cost saving recommendations for Erie County. The outline is a “living document” and will be regularly updated as new information, questions and topics are brought forward.

Insurance – Hospitalization (Mr. Forster) (February 25th)

Virtual Call with Mr. Trish Felix, CEP of Cornerstone Risk Management

Review

- What entities are self-insured?
 - Municipalities, Energy, Hospitality, Schools, Construction
- % increase in cost of hospitalization last year, last 5 years per entity
 - 2022 – 6.8%
 - 2023 – 11.5%
 - 2024 – NA
- What demographic considerations must be considered to prevent unintended consequences of a county-wide consortium of insureds, such as an increase in rates for an individual entity?
 - To be determined with feasibility study
- What is the potential size of the “pool” of personnel and entities that could be included in consortium?
 - Erie County has approx. 750 employees, 1500 lives on plan
 - City of Sandusky has approx. 250 employees and 640 lives
 - Townships at an estimate of 150
 - Perkins Township has 60 enrolled, with 120 lives
 - Village employment rates unsure.
 - School districts are in ‘HESE’
 - Huron-Erie School Employee Insurance Association
- Levels of Coverage needed and available
 - Based on number of employees:
 - 500 for Association Health Plan (AHP)
 - 1500 to use medical stop loss

- How will costs be shared by entity
 - Refer to feasibility study
- What it takes to form our own insurance company (removing the consortium element and purchasing directly)
 - Approximately 1500 employee base

Recommendations

Pooling somewhere or somehow needs to be reviewed as a benefit of the county and positive for smaller villages who are adversely impacted by insurance coverage.

1. Proof of concept
 - a. Health/ Property/Causality
2. Feasibility study and Business Plan for various insurance plan strategies to help determine what cost savings may look like
 - a. Leverage direct contract negotiations with area health providers as part of a larger delegation from the a captive plan
3. Formation and Implementation
4. Captive Insurance and Self Insurance plans are preferred over a consortium due to not paying profit to another org.,

Legislative Actions

Fire/EMS – (Mr. Moon and Mr. Parker) (March 4th)

Speakers: Chief Mario D’Amico, Sandusky Fire Department; Fire Chief David Murphy, Perkins Township Fire Department; Chief Brian Rospert, Milan Fire, Chief Kerry Jett, Groton Township Fire; Chief Frank Triana, Vermilion Fire

Review

- **Types and numbers of equipment individually and collectively?**
 - Have in the past added a countywide inventory of equipment (led by ret. Chief Johnson)
 - IT has a list in their CAD program to assist in mutual aid coordination of equipment
 - Subcommittee to work in coordinating equipment listing
- **Depreciation schedule for equipment replacements?**
 - The departments work off of national standards for timeline of replacements and each department is on a different timeline. Would be easier to coordinate through same vendor, but that does not always line up. Multitude of different reasons why it may not occur based on culture, timing, and department needs.
 - Ambulances get replaced more often and would be best opportunity for coordinated equipment replacement
 - Sandusky had limited financial impact based on ordering more than 1 ambulance at a time because of national delays/backups on fire apparatus
 - (700 engines in front of 1 new equipment piece for Sandusky)
 - Larger Cities (NYC) may be ordering 30 apparatus at once vs. locals needing 1 or 2, so no expected cost savings as demand is greater than supply
 - Used equipment – esp. fire trucks from cities could be transferred to outlying villages & townships
 - List from EMA should have trucks, back hoes, loaders, pickups, bulldozers, & police/EMS.
 - **WORK ON UPDATED LIST FROM TJ**
- **What large capital trucks would be able to be shared between entities?**
 - Perkins has previously borrowed ambulances from Sandusky and Margaretta
 - Works in emergency situations for short term solution while a separate vehicle is down
 - SFD and PTFD share their fire safety education trailers county wide to any department, as well as Norwalk’s Fire Department
 - Joint small purchasing is being shared across fire departments
 - SFD and PTFD also share their respective fire extinguisher trailers and training equipment, and are made available to other Erie County Fire Departments.

- State Bid pricing and Sourcewell are used for purchasing, and Sourcewell will match state bid pricing
- Milan has refurbished ladder truck last year as cost saving effort for 10-15 years
- Milan knows they can call in larger ladders (Perkins) versus purchasing a larger ladder truck
- Mutual Aid: biggest way fire departments share equipment and people, current staffing is below recommended standards but mutual aid fills the gap locally
- **Eminent replacements and estimated costs, per department**
 -
- **Any standardized equipment purchases or contracts**
 - Multiple departments made a group purchase of new cardiac monitors, saving several thousand dollars per monitor. Spearheaded by Perkins Township Fire Department (PTFD) Captain Pearson.
 - The group purchase of a new SCBA mask fit-testing kit. Led by Chief Jett, area departments will share the use and cost of the equipment.
- **Maintenance of vehicles, how much and by who per dep't**
 - Perkins – One maintenance person that handles the entire Township but focuses on smaller items. Major issues are taken to Sandusky local mechanic. Each apparatus is tied to own vendor and may go to them for large issues
 - Sandusky has fleet maintenance and has certifications required for fire departments that has worked well
 - Pay can be more competitive in private sector vs public sector
 - Would have to hire somebody who then needs specialized training for the apparatus
 - Maintenance wages may be more than current expenditures for maintenance with 3rd party
 - Vermilion TWP: yearly contract for maintenance (\$35k) with emergency availability within 24 hours to address maintenance issues
 - Mileage an issue with larger maintenance issues between the vendor and Vermilion TWP.
 - Local Firefighters will do light maintenance on vehicles within their scope of work
 - \$1200 per fire truck service call - Milan
- **Maintenance schedule for vehicles**
 -
- **Any interest in fleet maintenance concept**
 - Fleet Maintenance has worked well for Sandusky and have seen good turnaround times on equipment
 - Opportunity for sharing various mechanics around County based on availability

- **TO DO: find list of all entity mechanics (who is trainable)**
- **Maintenance/replacement schedule for response equipment (turnout gear, hoses)**
 - Very similar to fire trucks – 10 year life driven by vendors
 - Perkins & Sandusky - 5 year frontline, 5 year backline, then removed
 - Opportunity to go to single vendor? Possibility for pursuing but has some of the same issues as trucks currently
- **Standard uniform contracts**
 - Sandusky tries to shop local as possible, presumed a lot of the departments are using similar vendors at similar prices
 - Lucky Stone in Huron
 - Uniform allowance is a contractual amount that they have to replace a certain amount a year
- **Any standard contracts for response equipment.**
- **Number of full-time personnel vs part time/volunteers**
 - Huron: 15 full time 26 part time combined with Township
 - Sandusky: 51 Full time including admin
 - Perkins: 30 Full time
 - Vermilion TWP: 29, half are part time, half volunteers
 - Milan: 34 volunteers
 - Florence: 25 volunteers
 - Bay View: 16 volunteers
 - Margaretta: 9 full time, 13 part time
 - Groton/Oxford: 17 volunteers
 - Kelley's Island Fire: 4 (estimate)
 - Berlin Township Fire: 25 volunteers
- **Recruitment:**
 - Primarily advertising through Facebook/social media
 - Newspaper no longer used with generational shift
 - Some job fairs and advertisements to local fire training programs as testing comes around
- **Opportunities to share personnel and/or equipment costs, in progress or additional**
 - Doing that well through Mutual Aid
 - Previously mentioned was SFD and PTFD sharing their fire safety education trailers, fire extinguisher trailers and training equipment, Bay View sharing CPR equipment and mannequins for training, and PTFD sharing their technical resource trailer.
- **Facility maintenance schedule – roofs, windows, doors, furniture, lockers etc.**

- Sandusky – combination of city staff handling maintenance and contracting for larger projects
 - Anything over \$1k solicit 3 bids and primarily hire locals
 - Large maintenance contract may miss out on local contractors
- Perkins fire department staff will handle smaller items, and contract out larger projects
- Generators contractor might be an opportunity for county wide maintenance
- **Staff person for contracts/purchasing?**
 - Sandusky – Shift commanders in charge of handle soliciting/contracts, or public works department will help with larger bids over \$10k
- **Major facility improvements?**
 - Perkins – New fire station replacing two 80 year old stations
- **EMS planning for southern service area**
 - Florence uses Vermilion River Ambulance District (Citizens) and with Wakeman Fire Department ambulance or additional local mutual aid opportunities
 - Margaretta has their own Ambulance
 - Oxford, Groton, Milan have North Central EMS
 - North Central has been discussed long term about services, but Fisher Titus continues to support them
 - Southern local entities had ambulatory calls to cover North Central EMS
 - Squads as far as Bellevue (20 minutes)
- **Ideal Model for township ambulatory services?**
 - North Central has First Responder vehicle – but can be based on staffing/and calls for when its utilized
 - Milan has EMT on staff and adopted medical procedures
 - Run risk of doubling number of calls based on medical runs if no North Central and is cost prohibitive for the township
 - Vermilion TWP had issue with ambulatory service and volunteers becoming inundated with constant emergency calls
 - Do smaller departments need to consider moving towards full time status to support increased runs?
 - EMS involvement steadily increases call volume
 - Volunteers can be challenged based on increase calls and work/life balance
 - Milan - a full time staffed ambulance would take 6 full time people vs contract with North Central costing approx. \$75k
- **Training opportunities and levels of training for various depts.**
 - Constantly do joint training along with EMA, with ECEMA obtaining multiple grants to provide interagency technical rescue training

- Departments participate in interagency training when possible, including structure fires, joint training at EHOVE, rope rescue, confined space rescue, and many others.
- Bay View Volunteer Fire Department makes their CPR equipment and mannequins available to other Erie County Departments.
- Department specialties
 - Each works together to align specialties
- **Review any budget performance indicators – general trends**
- **Discuss budget**
 - Revenue and carry overs per spreadsheet provided by Zach
- **Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency**
- **Fire District Considerations?**
 - Discussed 15 years ago locally – focused on staffing issues at Sandusky and Perkins
 - Smaller volunteer communities trying to go full staffing
 - No countywide departments in state of Ohio–
 - West Licking is similar size as Perkins and Sandusky and runs 9000 calls a years (Website: <https://www.westlickingfire.org/>)
 - High levy (11 mills) to run the larger West Licking district
 - 110 staffing on West Licking – (Sandusky and Perkins are 80) has grown since originally 80
 - District may cost more money rather than save funds
 - Typically consolidations are a cost increase than a cost saving
 - Milan – Would not consider fire district
 - Capital costs increases on the front end of a district expansion would cost more than any savings
 - Expectation would not be for new personnel or stations, but using existing facilities in rural areas
 - Mutual aid replaces the district concept with existing facilities
 - 15 on site within 8 minutes is the national standard (NFPA 1710)
 - Mutual aid across the county means underserved fire departments are meeting the standard by running together
 - All departments with emergency medical transport operate under the same medical protocols, overseen by University Hospitals and Firelands Regional Medical Center, and makes for consistent medical treatment.
 - From ECTA – townships generally believe that some townships may need to consolidate into districts, including areas outside of county
 - Next 5-10 years

- Perkins, Huron, are financially ok and don't see a need in the future.
- **Current practices the fire chiefs do to promote cost savings?**
 - All operate on same protocol for medical protocol
 - County Standard Operating Guidelines
 - Erie County fire departments have multiple county standard operating guidelines covering incidents where multiple agencies may respond together. These include areas such as: incident command, hazardous materials response, active shooter incidents, and technical rescue emergencies.
 - Fire chiefs meet together every other month to have this conversation
 - Fire Chiefs identified future opportunities for cost sharing
 - Group purchase of firefighting foam.
 - Group purchase of ladder and pump testing services.
 - Group purchase of “fire blankets” for assisting with containment of electrical vehicle fires.
 - Potential expansion of automatic aid.
 - Various equipment may be group purchased if department replacement schedules align.
- **Billing for Kalahari**
 - Huron sees significant number of runs out there
 - Would bill for EMS – but is on the person who is using the services and not the park itself
 - Oxford, Margaretta, Groton bill runs for folks from outside these townships to not put bill on locals
 - Sandusky and Perkins bill everybody,
 - Perkins is a soft bill covered by insurance for residents

Recommendations

1. Ensure a comprehensive plan is in place with North Central (EMS) prior to the expiration of current contract
 - a. Response times are a concern for both Fire and EMS
2. Equipment
 - a. **Evaluate and Update the Replacement Schedule:** Review the current equipment lifecycle plan to ensure timely upgrades, minimize downtime, and maintain high operational standards
 - b. **Complete a Comprehensive Inventory Assessment:** Conduct a thorough audit of existing equipment to identify aging assets, surplus items, and immediate replacement needs.

- c. **Group Purchasing Opportunities:** Partner with other fire departments to secure better pricing on large – scale of high cost equipment, reducing overall expenditure
 - d. **Implement Equipment Redistribution Practices:** Extend the useful life of functional, older equipment by reallocating it to lower-volume or support units, maximizing asset utilization while controlling costs.
3. **Grant Application Pooling Schedule:** Create a strategy to streamline the grant application process by combining efforts across departments, creating a unified proposal that maximizes impact, efficiency, and competitiveness for a single funding opportunity
 4. Evaluate potential locations within Erie County for the installation of a centralized underbody wash system to support fleet maintenance, prevent corrosion, and extend vehicle lifespan
 5. Create a Service Schedule across departments. Routine Inspections, Maintenance Frequency, Preventative Maintenance, and Emergency Maintenance Protocol.
 6. Evaluate the feasibility of a shared mechanic system among fire departments for the efficient and cost-effective maintenance and repair of equipment. This program aims to pool resources, reduce maintenance costs, and ensure consistent, high-quality service

Police – (Mr. Forster and Mr. Parker) (March 11th)

(Chief Jared Oliver, City of Sandusky; Sheriff Paul Sigsworth, Erie County; Chief Jeffrey Musser, Perkins Township; Chief James Bartus II, Village of Kelleys Island; Chief Bob Meister Village of Milan)

Review

- **Number of officers per department, full and part-time.**
 - Full staff largely means available budgeted, all could use additional officers
 - Especially during peak seasonal events where officers are already largely shared
 - Sandusky – 53 budgeted but 48 actual with 5 full time with CP
 - Perkins – 24 FT, 2 PT
 - Sheriff – 98 FT including Admin, Dispatch and Staff, 21 PT
 - Kelley’s Island – 2 FT, 8 PT
 - Milan – 4 Budgeted with 3 full time and 10 total on staff
 -
- **Opportunities to share personnel and responsibilities**
 - Mutual Aid exists with ability to back each other up
 - Including assisting with FD too
 - Readily share department resources and knowledge based on departmental skills
 - Perkins/ECSO share some personnel
 - Officers work readily across jurisdictional borders on transfers and medical runs so not to trouble local office with increased responsibility/hindrance
 - “Keep police on the road”
 - **FLOCK** – Stationary camera system that coordinates regional responses between police departments and significantly cuts down on police man hours for investigative
 - Signals officers of license plates with active warrants, and departments can coordinate with local police to apprehend suspects
 - Sandusky previously applied for grant through OCJS – Violent Crime Reduction Grant, but system benefits multiple agencies
 - <https://www.flocksafety.com/>
 - <https://www.police1.com/tech-pulse/study-validates-impact-of-flock-safetys-lpr-technology-on-crime-clearance-rates>
 - All are on same **Records Management System** that allows departments to better coordinate together
 - Officers have increased first aid measures carried on person for incidents to better react to calls in fields

- Northern Border Initiative – Marine Patrol Boat at Sheriff Office and can be assisted with other agencies in conjunction with Border Patrol
 - Received Grant due to regionalized grant process through collaborative process of area departments
- Local departments interested in vehicle barricades for all jurisdictions for various festivals and activities
 - Working to get countywide grant from all first responders to have access these grants as coordination and partnership improves grant chances
- SRO's (School Resource Officers) invaluable to local police/school
 - Ability to coordinate Juvenile reports with schools
 - Develop relationships with students as a positive resource
- **Maintenance of equipment, how much and by who per department**
 - ECSO vehicles Maintained by County Garage
- **Maintenance schedule**
- **Eminent replacements, estimated costs, per department.**
 - Challenge in coordination of Grants for equipment beneficial to be shared with all in region.
 - Part time staff writer, but individual departments benefit from economy of scale by signing onto grants with additional departments
- **Facility maintenance schedule – roofs, windows, doors, furniture, lockers etc**
- **Facility/Technology improvements?**
 - Would be useful to have Staff Lead on grants for the group of first responders
 - Storage of digital evidence and access to it by legal teams has to be preserved
 - Terabyte's of information from digital footprints
 - Can future expenses of large data storage be able to coordinate costs with local data center? Perkins in early conversation on this
 - Police have some storage locally but Axon owns the market nationwide and future costs are expected
- **Jail services satisfactory? Budget manageable? Who contributes to the budget, and how much?**
 - All arrests tend to come to ECSO, and budget is supported by County Commissioners per ORC
- **Centralized dispatch is the model for cost savings via centralization of processes and personnel, are there other opportunities like this?**
 - Centralized Dispatch also a centralized intelligence model for quick communication between department
 - Police know their strengths as a department and aim to keep guys out on the road to serve the local community
 - One challenge has been mental health calls where departments may not be the best respondents to the situation

- Considerations for a **24/7** mental health response team who could best respond to mental health needs in real time and allow police to stay on road where their professional strengths are
 - Ottawa, Sandusky, Seneca, Wyandot, Huron, have five county response team
 - <https://connectionsrecovery.org/services/mcrt/>
 - Est. 80% of individuals in jail have underlying mental/substance abuse issue that drives crime issues
- **Can smaller villages sustain their own department? Review costs, hiring ability, turnover of personnel, retirements.**
 - Policing challenges are largely localized and individual based on municipality, but senior officers may move laterally to township and villages for change of pace
 - Sandusky currently handcuffed by rules/regulations of charter in their eligibility list that makes for slow hiring and processing times that townships and villages are not hindered by.
 - Nationally, less interest in Police and Fire services, and seen by Chiefs locally
- **Mutual Training opportunities such as EHOVE and Sandusky Police Academy**
 - Advanced in local training based on group effort and community focus to share training as a resource
 - Tailored to needs of local community
 - Departments will coordinate with Federal, State and local agencies, including fire departments, for training opportunities as they become available
 - Also coordinate with local schools on walkthroughs
- **Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency**
 - Four Suggestions by Police Chiefs in improving local department efficiencies:
 - Support Sandusky Charter to keep eligibility list open consistent with other departments
 - Establishment of a 24/7 Mental Health Response Team of trained professionals
 - Pursue a full time grant writer for emergency medical services to better coordinate grants based on economy of scale of departments and equipment coordination
 - Invest in growing number of FLOCK cameras to free up policing man hours for increased regional collaboration
 - Departments were also interested in concept of larger insurance groups where fiscally responsible

Recommendations

- Provide CIT Training

- **Grant Application Pooling Schedule:** Create a strategy to streamline the grant application process by combining efforts across departments, creating a unified proposal that maximizes impact, efficiency, and competitiveness for a single funding opportunity
 - **Flock Cameras**
- **Insurance** – of interest to local departments

Legislative Actions

Purchasing – (Ms. Crescimano and Mr. Forster) (March 18)

Denise Bellamy, ECEO; Emily Galloway, Erie County Finance; Keith Sexton, Vermilion Township; Yvonne Anderson, Sandusky Schools; Zachary Rospert, Milan Township;

Review

- **The County's political subdivisions existing procurement, purchasing and contracting policies.**
 - How do they make current purchasing decisions?
 - Can we streamline and improve the County's political subdivisions procurement, purchasing, and contracting functions and outcomes
 - Do the current practices result in increased costs and delays?
 - Largely utilizing Co-Ops and State bid resources for purchasing
 - Locals vendors willing to beat state pricing and has worked well
 - Some existing coordination in salt purchasing, energy, but others handled at different levels
- **Review of contracts with the State of Ohio Co-Op, for example, who utilizes the State of Ohio Co-Op? State contracts available are:**
 - Agricultural Chemicals, Seeds and Equipment
 - ECEO – Sourcewell, but locally will go lower than the co-op
 - Good relationship vendors will go to beat the state purchasing price
 - Ammunition, Firearms, Less-Lethal Munitions, Related Law Enforcement Supplies and Vehicles
 - Vehicles covered through co-op
 - Perkins – Shops around for best pricing, not typically bid out
 - Bulk purchasing for munitions could be an option
 - Computer Hardware, Software and IT Services
 - Perkins – Ordered through Dell with Co-Op pricing (\$400 cheaper than competitor for better comp.)
 - Copiers: Lease, Own, Pay per Copy
 - ECEO and Regional Planning – Owns copiers
 - Primarily leases for other offices
 - Department prerogative for what leases and who to go with
 - Can be super competitive
 - City schools lease through Xerox – competitive bidding
 - Fuels: Gasoline/Ethanol Blend, Unleaded Regular and Fuel Oils, Heating and Diesel
 - Perkins – Speedway with fleet pricing

- ECEO - Ordering large quantities on contract \$.01 cheaper than state contract
 - County handles sheriff and departments, vehicle maintenance handles contract same as ECEO
 - Only charge backs on departments outside of General Fund
 - Sandusky Schools recently got on-site gas tanks (BP)
 - Perkins Schools – Would fill up at BP with Fuel Man card
 - STS – Have a fuel tank at their garage and also used Fuel Man card
 - Considerations for under body wash and impact on fleet vehicles
- Office Furniture, Flooring
 - None
- Propane Gas: Bulk, Cylinder
 - None
- Salt: Table, Water, Softening, Ice Removal and Calcium Chloride
 - ECEO solicits 20 entities for 1 bid
 - Usually beats ODOT's contract
 - Growing list of entities
 - TBD on brine impact of salt usage
 - Expected salt savings over time
 - Perkins gets brine from Margaretta TWP from H2Ohio grant
- Vehicles: SUVs, Sedans, Specialty, Trucks
 - Typically locals are more competitive than state pricing
 - 3 county pool cars, JFS has their own,
 - Most departments have a vehicle replacement plan
- **Any reasons not to be using Co-Ops?**
 - Planning ahead for future large purchases
- **Does any political subdivision use a Co-Op other than the State of Ohio?**
 - None
 - EHOVE:
 - Ohio Schools Council
 - HPS
 - Northern Ohio Educational Computer Association
 - Huron-Erie School Employees Insurance Association
 - Bay Area Gas Consortium
 - Sourcewell
 - State of Ohio Cooperative Purchasing
 - Ms. Fiddler – Also uses HPS (Detention Center)
 - Ms. Anderson noted Furniture for Rotary Center Through Ohio Co-Op

- No bid process and limited savings but adds up over time
 - Milan TWP – Sourcewell for a back hoe (\$15K saved)
 - Ohio Township Association (OTA) – Partnered with Amazon for discounts
- **How do we increase communication about procurements and the procurement process?**
 - Is there a software solution to help enable bulk purchasing
 - Salt bidding as a model that ECEO does
 - County aggregation plan for gas and electric?
 - Schools are in energy consortium, including Huron and Ottawa County but larger schools are excluded due to building sq. ft. (Sandusky)
 - Creation of a listserv for purchasing
- **Are we ready to go the distance with procurement?**
 -
- **Does centralized county purchasing agent/strategy make sense?**
 - Milan TWP – probably does not buy enough with limited office supplies
 - School districts – printers are huge and would be one of the larger expected savings (done every 3 years)

Recommendations

- *Master Purchase List-Centralized*
 - *Notification of large purchases*
- *Ohio Purchase Co-op/List Serv*
- *Procurement Services (State and Local Agencies)*
- *Annually a list of purchases made*
 - *Google Form/County Website*

Legislative Actions

- None

IT– (Ms. Balconi Ghezzi and Mr. Tucker) (March 25, 11AM)

Trudy Riddle, Jobs and Family Services; Mark Wroblewski, Erie County Auditor.

Review

- What all software platforms and services are being used right now by the separate entities and how are they charged? (per unit)
 - GIS Advisory Board (AB) established in 2006, includes municipalities and other entities with cost share agreement. Sharing info/data in real time, ~209 named users currently on cloud based program, public and businesses utilize it too. Good Example of existing cost share services.
 - Not everyone on Microsoft 365 platform,
 - Google an alternative at lower cost others have utilized
 - Village expenses have been challenges for IT
- Provide an electronic data forum for entities to share good practices, related to service, efficiency, safety etc.?
 - Ex. Perkins determines cost saving measure that is quickly published and are able to share info on operating experience
 - Mutual interest for database/forum to readily share best practices?
 - School districts have ITC sites (NOECA) and is resource for schools to share resources
 - Is this available to be utilized by local entities?
 - If not, would Council of Government (COG) be able to be formed and become purchasing agent for this?
 - Townships use same financial program (UAN)
- Data Management for evidence has been a challenge for police. Any actions here for improved data management?
 - Perkins – Revamping retention schedule currently, but majority of data is currently records retention
 - Trend to move away from paper towards cloud sources
 - Vermilion TWP – Challenge to move towards digital records of paper files is a challenge
 - Determine county wide scanning policy/procedure and shared cloud service to make data management and records retention easier to access
- Countywide directory for field experts/specialists
 - UAN is sending out new computers to each entity, and may have to hire out to set up these computers for each new village/twp.
 - Cities, county, schools have own IT, but smaller entities do not.
 - Room for shared service?
 - Castalia utilizes IT services through Margaretta Township

- Establishment of Listserv/Directory to help fill gaps for questions/needs for local entities
- Erie County Cares (Trudy Riddle)
 - 2021 Committee formed to create website of county services
 - Currently, health department receives e-mails and directs them towards services
 - Hoping to staff with health department to respond to phone calls and follow up person
 - Looking to cut back on duplication of services, to help establish self-sufficiency
 - People go agency to agency looking for housing help, but looking for resolution to issue rather than short term solutions of challenges
 - No cost resource for locals
 - Intent to eventually encourage employers to advertise with website to help financially sustain resource as a benefit to community
- Perform evaluation of IT compatibility and efficiency
- HIPAA and Security planning
 - Desire for professionals to manage data for security purposes
 - Perkins – Contract with DMC for security
 - Includes notices on latest phishing scams and education
- Cloud based computing vs. ongoing server maintenance by locals
 - How does new data center impact servers/cloud?
 - County - Cloud computing solutions with everything integrated
 - Milan Library – ClevNet system tied in for benefit to locals
 - BoE – contracts for security that also includes ongoing education
- IT Training
 - School districts will share resources/individuals for training
 - Could develop list of trainers to be shared resource for programs
 - Firelands BGSU could be available for local training
 - JFS: Incumbent worker training – will reimburse up to 50% for training
 - NorthPoint offers technology related training
 - All relates back to countywide directory for sharing these resources
- Software licensing (requirements vs options) and how to ensure we share these
 -
- Software Alignment
 - IWorq: Managed by Auditor office but shared software with townships covering annual fee
 - GIS AB is governmental entity, with everything covered at a rate based on population (under 100,000)
- Software Engineer

- GIS – Application development
- Local government can have a challenge affording the skillsets to develop these sort of resources
 - Better to find vendor
- **SC Strategic Solutions** – have good luck with them as local vendor, also help with record retention
- Any other areas/comments?
 - Digital traffic control to monitor countywide hacking/ransomware challenges
- Seems like review countywide existing practices and software, and review a user group for buying power
 - Previous board could be reestablished from what has existing in the past, previously ran by Erie County IT
 - Data Processing Board – County Treasurer, Recorder, Clerk of Courts, Commissioner Rep, Auditor, 2 BOE members: (1 Republican, 1 Democrat)
- Database of experts to share services and training

Recommendations

- *Create a list of programs used across Erie County*
- *Software/Licensing*
 - *Look at Group purchase of **Microsoft 365***
 - *Cloud Services*
 - *Security*
- *Record Retention and converting to digital storage*
- *Align Data Center*
- *(Erie County Cares) Increase access to services*

Legislative Actions

- *None*

Infrastructure - Water, Sewer & Water & Sewer Plant Operations (Mr. Moon and Mr. Krabill) (April 1st)

John Rufo, Erie County Department of Environmental Services; Aaron Klein and John Orzech, City of Sandusky; Eric Wobser, GSP

Review

- Vermilion, Sandusky, Huron operate water and sewer plants. Are the cities satisfied that they are maximizing production capacity? Like baseload electric power plants, operation at near or full capacity can reduce costs per units measured of production.
 - Seems that entities were overall okay with current capacity, although that doesn't mean future planning for those isn't being thought of.
- Metrics tracked for current production costs at each plant.
- Condition of water plants acceptable?
- Major maintenance, Capital improvements or extra capacity needed in the near future (less than 5 years)? Long term - > 5 years?
 - The planning of future improvements and capacity are always being considered 5, 10, and 20 years out.
 - Future development (State Route 4) delayed due to lack of capacity.
- Would centralized dispatching of water from the plants conceivably reduce costs? Leads into next question;
- What about centralized maintenance planning and capital improvement coordination like a rural water district, but just for plants?
 - Current mutual agreement between water and sewer departments.
- Is routine maintenance primarily in-house or contract?
 - City of Sandusky currently uses in house staff for maintenance
 - 20-30 in house staff between sewer, water and utility personnel
 - Erie County currently uses in house staff for maintenance
 - Village of Milan will use in house and outsource work.
 - Could Erie County be used to assist smaller township and villages
- Are plant operators & maintenance personnel effectively utilized or used in other capacities during “down” time? Or could there be a “traveling” maintenance crew within the county?
 - Erie County and the City of Sandusky both indicated that they cross train, work during down time not discussed.
- Costs per units measured /customer for Erie County, Sandusky, Huron, Vermilion
- All other performance indicators tracked by water departments' management
- Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency
 - Maintenance of current pipes is ongoing.
 - Target repeat pipes for future projects.

- GIS is being utilized by entities for breaks and where to replace.
- Financial incentives for regionalization at state level
 - Potential saving on grants for coordination on projects.
 - TIF's
- Impact of water and sewer on development
 - Could capacity or lack of hinder future development
- What have other governments done to remove themselves from the public utility (e.x. regional districts)
- How do EPA mandates change or delay actions as regional entities work to collaborate locally
 - Erie County is currently on a mandate, no indication that it is delaying entities to work together.
 - Entities seemed open to the idea on collaboration of sewer and water projects if align.

Recommendations

- Develop a feasibility study examining water and sewer regionalization

Legislative Actions

- *None*

Public Transportation – (Ms. Balconi Ghezzi and Mr. Krabill) (April 8th)

Colleen Gilson and James Stacey, City of Sandusky

Review

- Possible centralized hub in Sandusky to service more expansive area outside of city limit
 - Existing
- What is the appetite for expanded services county wide from other municipalities
 - STS could do additional reach out to inform smaller township and villages or Dial-a-Ride
- Current customer base
 - Diverse customer base ranging from locals traveling to work and leisure, out of towns for work and leisure, seniors, and veterans.
- Current scheduling and operations
 - Dial-a-Ride – Monday thru Saturday, 6am-10pm, anywhere in Erie County - \$5.00
 - Fixed Route – 6-7 days a week, 6am-10:30pm, 5 Routes/Sandusky and Perkins, 1 Bus per hr. \$2.00
- Current funding sources
 - FTA Federal Loans, City Funds, Contract Revenue, State Assistance, and Farebox
- How to better site bus stops/facilities
 - Problems with getting in contact with right people (mall)
- Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency
 - 2023 HDR Study provided SWOT analysis and review of STS transit vs. comparable transit systems in the state.
 - Advertising
 - Transit App

Recommendations

The Commission has chosen not to make any recommendations at this point.

Legislative Actions

- *None*

Education – (Mr. Tucker and Ms. Crescimano at McCormick Middle School) (April 15th)

(Insert Speaker Here)

Review

- Hospitalization/Healthcare costs acceptable? Interest in pooling?
 - HESE -13 School Districts
 - NOECA – 49 Schools 7 that are Erie County
 - Bay Area Gas – 25 School Districts
- Transportation costs? What governs the amount and size of buses? Is there a rule of thumb or a state requirement? Does every bus still need to be standard size or can some be downsized to 37 passenger airport bus size? Smaller can be safer, less initial cost, and less expensive for maintenance and fuel. Observations noted are that some bus routes are running at low capacity.
 - Some pooling and vehicle size has been done in special cases, but may be worth future discussion
 - Busses run \$150k now, and ordering delays cause issues
 - Bus drivers
 - Strict testing and licensing requirements
 - including raised wages to attract drivers
- Fleet maintenance, who performs it, where
 - Possible mechanic for school buses
 - Under wash facility – idea expressed in previous public meeting. This is another cross-cutting issue that has merit, but where, and how much, how to fund are issues.
 - Enzo – Local business for under wash has been used
- Are alternatives to costly capital improvements being actively pursued?
 - Ohio Schools Council offers financial saving to schools
- What administrative functions are feasible to share?
 - Previous efforts by Perkins to share school treasurer
 - School social workers at each school (Goes through ESC)
 - Specialty Teachers (Foreign Language, Honors Classes)
- Snow & ice removal, contract or in-house? In-house cost?
 - Perkins assists in some snow/ice removal/SD handles remainder
 - Sandusky City School performs its own snow removal.
- Review budget performance indicators
 - FY24 Cupp Report saved, to be shared with Commission in advance of meeting with Board Packets
- Expenditures per student per district?

- Detailed School Finance Payment Report (SFPR) found and saved, will be shared with Commission in advance of meeting with Board Packets (in lieu of SF-3 Data)
- Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency
 - Healthcare (Sandusky City School on own plan)
 - Bay Area Gas
 - NOECA

Recommendations

1. *List the analysis of enrollment numbers with reserve numbers to show inefficiency and effectiveness*
2. *Combining Administration (Treasurer and Superintendent)*
 - *Support staff – curriculum directors(district wide), social workers (building)*
 - *Facilities long-term planning*
 - *Cost sharing of services*
3. *Bus Driver Testing and Licensing Requirements*

Legislative Actions

Entity Administrative Staffing -Human Resources & Employee Benefits (Ms. Crescimano, Ms. Balconi Ghezzi, and Mr. Tucker) (April 22nd)

Combination of HR & Erie County Facilities Topics, Pivoted to Local Courts in Document

(Potential invitees: Matt Wilson, Josh Mesenburg (UIS))

Review

- Determine administrative costs of court system
 - Determine what can be shared
 - Judge staffing all have individual staff, and is there a possibility for any overlap
 - 4 Common Pleas court in EC, with 4 judges and 4 staff each
 - Also includes Sheriff's Office staffing
 - Juvenile Court is clerk of their own court, with approx. 40 staffing on both sides (CCF and Detention) for approx. 80 employees
 - CCF is grant funded through Ohio Dept of Youth Services, \$3M budget
 - Approx. 30 beds on CCF, 36 bed on detention, with bed rentals to surrounding counties
 - Mostly from surrounding counties including Lorain and Cuyahoga
 - 2024 Average daily population was 15
 - Has 4D contract but receives no direct funding from JFS
 - Has a bailiff and does not share staffing with other courts
 - Bailiff stays busy across 3 court rooms
 - Staffing levels has remained consistent in previous years
 - Staffing turnover and applications have been slow to come in
 - Applications are through EC HR
 - Interpreters on contract and can be expensive
 - **Option for full time employment vs. contracting?**
 - County had state legislative action for 4th judge election in 2005
 - Budgets have increased since with shortening dockets
 - Judges have redundancies in certain processes (eg, Mailers for Jury Duty) that could benefit from being centralized
 - Shared personnel can be a challenge with specialized knowledge bases
- JobsOhio
 - Preventing fraud is a savings to tax payers
 - State and federal changes and challenges could be instituted to help reduce fraud through card stealing/skimming and impact tax savings statewide
 - Conversation with local lawmakers could help emphasize fraud strategies that impact statewide taxes

- What entities have:
 - Planning departments, how many planners, and budget?
 - Project Managers, how many, budget?
 - HR managers, how many, budget
 - PR personnel, how many, budget?
- Any opportunities to share the above or any other administrative resources?
- ECEDC, Shores and Islands, GSP should be included as entities provide the funding.
 - Receive local entity funding, so what resources do they use that can be best shared amongst everyone
 - Erie County Chamber previously offered Health Plans, but unknown if GSP offers it still similar to how GCP offers the “COSE” program
- Buildings & grounds, in-house or contracted or a combination?
- Possible addition to county website for links to various entity building zoning, sewer, water driveway permitting process – one stop shop. May not save costs but would reduce burden of finding the who, what, where for residents.
- Is there a way to better cooperate from an HR standpoint?
 - Small business challenge is for HR support and is a need in area identified by Firelands Forward -
- Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency

Recommendations

“Look at historic budgets and case load for court systems; fraud impacts statewide tax costs and needs to be pushed for legislative awareness.”

1. Lobby General Assembly to remove 1 of the 3 commons pleas judges
 - a. (Highlight reduced case load, costs)
 - b. \$500,000 estimated savings
2. Goal in next 5-10 years to share services
 - a. Juvenile operates separately so call out separate
 - b. Determine language on future possible coordinated efforts
3. Encourage public to report fraud (Citizens as actors to help reduce fraud)
4. Legislation and enforcement at state level for fraud reduction
 - a. More of a statement – (Over \$1M in EC alone)
 - b. Broaden language on citizens as actors to help reduce fraud
 - c. *KBG incorporating fraud SSI numbers*

Legislative Actions

Infrastructure - Roads/Street Maintenance (Mr. Moon and Mr. Parker) (April 29th)

(Eric Dodrill, Erie County Engineer)

Review

- Major maintenance, Capital improvements or extra capacity needed in the near future (less than 5 years)? Long term - > 5 years?
 - It was proposed by Erie County Engineer and a memo was sent out from the Erie County Township Association president and the County Engineer last week requesting a plan from each township
 - Received Oxford, Margaretta, Perkins, Florence
 - Overall planning benefits were discussed such as cooperative contracts for any preventive maintenance (PM) such as thin overlay, micros-seal, crack seal, 2-inch overlay, chip seal, etc. Including cities in contracts in some cases could raise costs for rural areas due to costs in the cities are driven higher due to increased traffic control costs and mobilization costs and the piecework involved in working around manholes and other utility obstructions. Sandusky sets mobilization cost limits in the bids; however contractors are likely to make up for any possible underestimates by adding the cost to another area of a bid.
 - County, and townships concluded that by sharing 3–5-year road and street maintenance plan, the townships and county could benefit from cooperative contracting for work and purchases, the cities may wish to participate in some cases to reduce costs.
 - The County Engineer proposed informal quarterly meetings with townships to discuss work and issues that participants favor.
- Is routine maintenance primarily in-house or contract?
 - Primarily vehicle maintenance
 - Perkins Township has a staff mechanic that handles much of their maintenance
 - Sandusky has a facility and staff for maintenance.
 - Berlin Township they use American Diesel for out of warranty work.
 - Under wash facility – idea expressed in previous public meeting. This is another cross-cutting issue that has merit, but where, and how much, how to fund are issues.
- Snow Removal and Service
 - Use of brine to pre-wet salt and reduce bulk salt costs – Margaretta purchased brine mixing machine via grant and is letting Perkins purchase brine. Groton and Oxford will work with Margaretta on a similar deal. The Erie County Highway department may also want to share.
 - Township Trustee Coleman noted that when the salt is treated as it comes out of the truck it reduces splattering, which is up to 30-40%. The salt

sticks better and helps prevent hard pack ice formation which takes 10 time more salt to remove than just snow.

- Townships and county drivers work together to work out efficient snow removal routes to reduce time and costs
- Equipment Sharing
 - Oxford-Margaretta-Groton (OMG) have jointly purchased used a road roller, new asphalt crack sealing machine, new mini-track hoe, and used paving machine. Erie County and OMG share equipment and personnel to do smaller paving jobs at about 60% of a contractor cost to mobilize and lay asphalt for small jobs.
 - Combined work for 3 townships last year resulted in approx. 6000 tons of asphalt being laid.
 - OMG team assists the county with some small jobs (Columbus Ave, Hull Rd bridge deck).
 - The County Highway Dept. frequently assists with trucks and last year Margaretta paid for a local contractor to assist with semi-trucks with Flow Boy systems to speed up the work.
 - Crack Sealing – Purchasing in large quantities may be done by contractor, this could be a cooperative contract.
 - Perkins – State Dept of Administrative Services, 101L (and a 101G), competitive state bid price for crack sealing contractors
 - *FYI: Trustees need to pass Resolution to enter into contract*
 - Graders – Erie County has 3 graders that could possibly be shared.
 - Brine – Refer to snow removal.
 - Mini Excavators – Most townships have their own, OMG did a shared purchase in 2024.
 - Backhoes – Was agreed this piece of equipment that is not used much anymore.
 - Vacuum trucks – County Highway department assists townships quite frequently. (Formerly Perkins)
 - Sandusky has their own
 - Hydro-jet Sewer Cleaning – same as above
 - County purchased Perkins truck
 - Local contracts with Franklin or Fox for villages and townships
 - Tree trimming – Generally this is contracted and for rural areas non-routine, thus contracted as needed
 - Sandusky has a forestry dept.
 - Coordinate road bidding projects together among cities, townships, villages
 - By sharing road plans with the County Engineer, townships and the county could benefit from cooperative contracting for work and purchases. This would expand on the current program that was instituted decades ago. Cities may also benefit.

- Fleet maintenance, fleet garage, and fleet mechanic concept might benefit townships, cities, villages and school districts. Even within the Erie County Departments, this could be beneficial.
- Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency
- Future meeting with ECEO and key townships officials to add items to this topic
- Level 3 events – how to best share resources
 - Note: ODOT has joint agreements/mutual aid and contracts with local contractors on assistance
- In regards to paying for shared services contracts (Crack Sealing)
 - Cost aggregation strategy has worked for ECSWD
 - ECEO can aggregate a bigger program with each entity able to enter into own contracts but one aggregated program for a service provider
- State has Best Management Practices (BMP) for cost savings strategies
 - See if ODOT makes info readily available
- Centralized fleet maintenance concept feasible?
 - Broad skillset to maintain all equipment can be a challenge
 - Perkins – Staff mechanic currently has no time outside of current workload
 - Larger items they may not have qualifications or large scale equipment for specialized lifts will be contracted out to maintain national standards
 - Margaretta – Limited work they have to tear apart, most work is preventative maintenance
 - Had used Oxford facilities to tear apart Grader as OMG
 - Can do in house and save for the three townships versus contracting out
 - Townships have limited staff filling numerous roles and readily work together with surrounding townships to respond to immediate issues
- Knowledge, ability and dedication of various departments across all entities work well together with broad skillset and respond to a variety of challenges daily

Recommendations

- Call out that the following are already being implemented:
 - Development of 3-5 year local plans to help collaborate larger scale contracts
 - Equipment rentals and sharing
 - Establish quarterly meetings with local entities to help coordinate projects
 - As began in subcommittee discussion
 - *See MP Notes*

Legislative Actions

- *None*

Economic Development – (Mr. Krabill and Mr. Parker) (May 6th)

Eric Wobser, GSP; Gary Boyle, Perkins Township; Colleen Gilson, City of Sandusky; Huron Representative; Zach Rospert, Erie County Regional Planning

Review

- What entities are currently expending public dollars to pursue economic and community development? Cities, villages, townships, county, regional planning, Shores & Islands, GSP, etc.?
 - Cities, villages, townships contribute through ECEDC
 - GSP – Total budget
 - Approx. 1/3 private investment/memberships,
 - 1/3 revenue through programs/fees,
 - 1/3 through public sources
 - City of Sandusky - \$500K Annually
 - Land Bank – DTAC at \$250K
 - Port Authority \$300K
 - S&IO for Erie/Ottawa - \$3-3.5M through marketing, grants, events
 - Various local incentives through abatement
 - Economic Development Administration (EDA)
- What income streams are solely devoted to pursuing development? Lodging tax for cities, township, and Shores & Islands, Community Improvement Corporation, Port Authority, Land Bank, etc.?
 - See responses above
- What tools are being used by public entities to pursue development (i.e. tax incentives, grants, etc.)? Do communities calculate ROI on these investments and can they be used to lessen the tax burden on residents? Also, how can they be used to invest in public infrastructure that offers benefits to the community as a whole?
 - Tools: TIFs, Grants, Loans
 - ROI tracked on lodging tax sales through GSP studies and calculated payback period to ensure strong ROI
 - Review future direct and indirect spending through market studies
 - Critical tool for local governments to determine ripple effect of investment based on studies
- What coordination is occurring among entities pursuing economic and community development? Are there opportunities for more partnership and cooperation?
 - Infrastructure – Sewer, water, an impact on housing
 - Great deal of coordination going on with all entities

- How are demographic and population changes going to affect the tax base moving forward? Does population stagnation and a declining school-age population lead to a greater cost burden on current residents?
 - Mr. Wobser shared demographics of Erie County population by decade by age group. Demographics show a decrease in working age adults and an increase in retirees living in Erie County.
 - Need to work on the housing stock to attract working age adults to this area
 - Find ways to accommodate older adults
 - Dive deeper on future impacts to tax base based on population changes
 - Coordination with water and sewer projects to fill the gaps in infrastructure
- Activities planned or in progress to improve efficiency
 - Lowering the overall tax burden on residents impacts housing locally, and goal of Blue Ribbon Commission is to address government spending

Recommendations

- Pursue more private, non-public funds as needed
- Encourage use and expansion on ROI on public projects through market studies

Legislative Actions

- None

Public Health Resources – (Ms. Karen Balconi Ghezzi)

(May 20th at 10AM)

Erie County Job and Family Services, Erie County Health Department, Erie County Alcohol, Drug Addiction, and Board of DD

What is the total annual budget for your organization?

- JFS - \$200M budget but \$2M from General Fund goes into child placement
 - Health Department - \$24 million
 - FQHC - \$2 million
 - Alcohol, Drug Addiction, Mental Health & Services - \$6 million
 - Board of DD - \$9.9 million
- What local funding do your organizations rely on versus how much do you receive in state/federal grants?
 - JFS - receives 1% of its budget from the County General Fund, the rest is State/Federal Grants
 - Health Department - \$2.4 million levy funds (10% of budget)
Balance comes from collection of various fees, licenses and permits.
 - ADAMHS- 52% levy funds
Federal Grants - \$1.2 million
Ohio Dept. of Health – 20%
 - Board of DD – Federal grants – 15-17%
Local grants – 8%
State grants – 1%
Levy funds (3.0 mill) – 75%
Partial rollbacks, per the Budget Commission from 2021-2025, have saved taxpayers \$5.8 million
- What partnerships currently exist with other public health agencies? Are there other partnership opportunities that would create efficiencies?
 - Health Dept. - 100's of agencies i.e., Ohio Department of Public Health, Department of Agriculture, USDA, Firelands Regional Medical Center, Erie County EMA, Ohio EMA.
 - ADAMHS - ADAMHS contracts with 14 agencies including Health Department, Community Foundation, Board of DD and United Way, JFS, Health Dept., Jail and providing services to the Local School Districts.
 - Board of DD - ADAMHS, Family & Children First Council and JFS

- What duplications exist in the public health arena in Erie County? Are there opportunities to save costs?
 - Health Dept. - Mr. Schade stated Health Departments work closely with Infectious Disease Control and he believes that there is more than enough need for other health centers to exist.
 - ADAMHS - The mental health system has a myriad of providers that ADAMHS works with in conjunction. The Board determined not to partner with for-profit entities to ensure the highest of standards are met with their dollars.
 - Board of DD - No other agency in Erie County provides the services that Board of DD provides, so there are no duplication of services.

11:00 AM – Libraries (Berlin-Milan, Ritter Public, Sandusky Public) and MetroParks

1. What is the total annual budget for your organization?
 - a. Berlin-Milan - \$1.16 million or \$135.50 per person per year
 - b. Ritter Public- \$1.6 million
 - c. Sandusky Public - \$4.8 million + \$600,00- special restriction funds = \$5.4 million
2. What local funding do your organizations rely on versus how much do you receive in state/federal grants?
 - a. Berlin-Milan - Property tax collections – 44.78%
 Public Library Fund (PLF) – 47.3% (state funding)
 Donations, fines and fees – 0.59%
 Endowment fund – 7.25%
 - b. Ritter Public- Local Levies – 55%
 Public Library Fund (PLF) – 45% (state funding)
 Receive several small local grants
 - c. Sandusky Public - Local Levies – 45% (\$1.6 million)
 Public Library Fund (PLF) – 55% (state funding)
 Received a city grant, using ARPA funds to building renovations
3. Percentage of budget for personnel and benefits?
 - a. Berlin-Milan - 57 ¼% of total budget
 - b. Ritter Public- n/a
 - c. Sandusky Public – 50% of total budget
4. What is your total carryover, and for what are you encumbering your carryover?
 - a. Berlin-Milan - \$1.6 million
 - b. Ritter Public- \$900,000
 - c. Sandusky Public – \$9 million

5. How are funds distributed for MetroParks?
 - Currently, MetroParks brings in \$2.5 million between two alternating five-year levies. MetroParks partners with many agencies to leverage and expand the outreach to provide additional programming.
6. What duplications exist in the library systems in Erie County? Are there opportunities to save costs?
 - Libraries partner with Clevnet
 - Libraries could share personnel duties such as HR and security (personnel has not been replaced to pre-covid levels)

Recommendations

- Libraries:
- Continue to maintain fiscal restraint with two-year budget outlook
- Continue working with less
- Possible consolidation of supply purchases
- Existing insurance practices with Stark County Council of Governments (COG) is a positive example of saving on Health Insurance

MetroParks:

- No recommendations

Legislative Actions

- None

Family Health Services

Mr. David Tatro, Sr., MPA, FABC, CEO/CFO of Family Health Services was not able to attend this Blue Ribbon Commission Meeting. He scheduled a separate meeting at a later date with Jeff Krabill. Tom Forster joined Jeff at this meeting, and the following is some information that was learned at this meeting.

Family Health Services is one of two Federally Qualified Health Centers in Erie County. It was the first FQHC until the Erie County Health Department decided to create its own in roughly 2015. Originally opened as a “look alike” FQHC, FHS received a 330 Grant in 2015 and now is the “safety net for Erie County” residents. Family Health Services provides the following services:

- Primary Care
- Women's Health
- Behavioral Health
- Dental
- Pharmacy
- Senior-Focused Care
- Nutrition Services
- Telehealth medicine
- Free Transportation

Their payor mix is...

- 60% Medicaid
- 20% Commercial Insurance
- 15% Medicare
- 5% Uninsured

Family Health Services provides about \$16,000,000 of care annually and sees 18,000 patients at its four area locations. By comparison, the Erie County Health Department's FQHC sees about 5,000 patients. Of note is that FHC serves their 18,000 patients at about half the cost of the Erie County Health Department's FQHC. FHC has about 140 employees.

Recommendations

- No recommendations

NOTE: Two family health services organizations (Health Department and Family Health Services) funded by the Federal Government is highly unusual. A suggestion would be to avoid increasing county costs on public health resources.

Legislative Actions

- None